

RECEIVED

39 Green Street Post Office Box 2490 Augusta, ME 04338-2490

> Tel: 207 / 622 - 7045 Fax: 207 / 622 - 7077

E: consumerhealth@mainecahc.org

Web: www.mainecahc.org

June 16, 2006

Advocating the right to health care for every man, woman and child.

#### BOARD OF DIRECTORS

President
Sally Sutton, MA, MSSW
Public Policy and Nonprofit
Management Consultant

Vice President
Neena Quirion
Maine Council of Senior Citizens

Secretary Jenny Rottman Maine People's Alliance

Treasurer Sarah Standiford Maine Women's Lobby

Nicole Clegg Family Planning Association of Maine

Roy Gedat Maine PASA

Alice Knapp, Esq. Law Office of Alice E. Knapp

Ned McCann Maine AFL-CIO

Marc Mutty Roman Catholic Diocese

Patricia S. Philbrook, RNC, NP Maine State Nurses Association

Chris Quint
Planned Parenthood of NNE

Catherine Stakeman, MSW, National Association of Social Workers – Maine Chapter

Joseph P. Ditré, Esq. Executive Director

# VIA CERTIFIED MAIL, RETURN RECEIPT REQUESTED

Sally Bourget, Clerk of Court Cumberland County Superior Court 142 Federal Street P.O. Box 287 Portland, Maine 04112-0287

Re: Maine Association of Health Plans v. Dirigo Health Agency Docket No. AP 05-94

Dear Ms. Bourget:

Please find enclosed Consumers for Affordable Health Care's Objection to Motion for Clarification.

Thank you for your attention in this matter.

Respectfully submitted,

Joseph P. Ditré, Esq., Bar #3719 Consumers for Affordable Health Care 39 Green Street, P.O. Box 2490 Augusta, ME 04338-2490 jditre@majnecahc.org

Jack Comart, Esq.
Maine Equal Justice
126 Sewall Street
Augusta, Maine 04330
jcomart@mejp.org

## Counsel to

Consumers for Affordable Health Care

Pc:
William H. Laubenstein, III, Esq.
William H. Stiles, Esq.
D. Michael Frink, Esq.
Bruce C. Gerrity, Esq.
Christopher T. Roach, Esq.

STATE OF MAINE CUMBERLAND, ss.	CIVIL ACTION  Docket No. AP-05-94
MAINE ASSOCIATION OF	)
HEALTH PLANS, ET AL	)
Plaintiffs/Petitioners	)
v.	) FILING COVER SHEET OF ) CONSUMERS FOR AFFORDABLE HEALTH CARE'S OBJECTION TO
DIRIGO HEALTH AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS	) MOTION FOR CLARIFICATION )
Defendant/Respondent	<b>'</b>

Date filed:

Friday, June 16, 2006

Name of party:

Consumers for Affordable Health Care

Document title:

Consumers for Affordable Health Care Objection to Motion for Clarification

Document type:

Objection to Motion

Confidential:

No

Respectfully submitted,

Joseph P. Ditré, Esq., Bar #3719 Consumers for Affordable Health Care 39 Green Street, P.O. Box 2490 Augusta, ME 04338-2490 jditre@mainecahc.org

Jack Comart, Esq.
Maine Equal Justice
126 Sewall Street
Augusta, Maine 04330
jcomart@mejp.org

Counsel to

Consumers for Affordable Health Care

STATE OF MAINE CUMBERLAND, ss.	SUPERIOR COURT CIVIL ACTION Docket No. AP-05-94
MAINE ASSOCIATION OF	)
HEALTH PLANS, ET AL	)
Plaintiffs/Petitioners	)
v.	) COMSUMERS FOR AFFORDABLE ) HEALTH CARE'S OBJECTION TO MOTION FOR CLARIFICATION
DIRIGO HEALTH AGENCY BOARD OF DIRECTORS	) ) ) )
Defendant/Respondent	,

Consumers for Affordable Health Care objects to the Petitioners/Plaintiffs' Motion for Clarification. The simple reason for Consumers' objection is that the Petitioners have failed to comply with the elemental requirements for issuance of a stay.

Petitioners seek a stay of the Agency's collection of the savings off-set payment ("SOP"). Rule 80C(b) and 5 M.R.S.A. § 11004 govern stays of agency decisions. The statute requires that the Petitioner demonstrate "irreparable injury", a "strong likelihood of success on the merits" and "no substantial harm to the adverse parties or the general public." In addition, "the motion shall show the reasons for the relief requested and the facts relied upon, which facts, if subject to dispute, shall be supported by affidavits."

Procedurally, Petitioners' Motion fails to even mention these elemental requirements.

Substantively, Petitioners have failed to make a showing on any of the elements. For example,

Petitioners have failed to show that there would be "no substantial harm to the adverse parties or

the general public." As this Court is aware, the SOP funds health care for approximately 17,000 people in Maine. Petitioners' motion, if granted, would seriously harm the general public.

Petitioners' Motion seems to skirt compliance with 5 M.R.S.A. §11004 and instead Petitioners ask this Court to stay collection of the SOP because to do otherwise would be "unfair." However, the Court's May 19, 2006 Order Granting Dirigo Health's Motion for Stay is simply a continuance granted for sound reasons of judicial economy. If Petitioners ultimately prevail in their initial and fundamental challenge in Maine Association of Health Plans, et. al. v. Superintendent of Insurance, Docket No. AP-05-90/85/96, then Petitioners will prevail in this lawsuit. In short, the Court's May 19<sup>th</sup> Order does not delay resolution of Petitioners' challenge in the instant litigation.

Accordingly, Petitioners' Motion for Clarification should be denied.

Date: June 16, 2006

Respectfully submitted,

Joseph P. Ditré, Esq. Bar #3719 Consumers for Affordable Health Care 39 Green St., P.O. Box 2490 Augusta, Maine 04338-2490

(207) 622-7045 jditre@mainecahc.org

Jack Comart, Esq.
Maine Equal Justice
126 Sewall Street
Augusta, Maine 04330
jcomart@mejp.org

Counsel to

Consumers for Affordable Health Care

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that on June 16, 2006, copies of Consumers for Affordable Health Care's Objection to Motion for Clarification were served on each of the persons listed below by first class mail and electronically.

### William H. Laubenstein, III, Esquire

Office of the Attorney General 6 State House Station Augusta, Maine 04333-0006

#### Christopher T. Roach, Esquire

Pierce Atwood One Monument Square Portland, Maine 04101

Bruce C. Gerrity, Esquire Roy T. Pierce, Esquire PretiFlaherty One City Center P.O. Box 9546 Portland, ME 04112-9546

#### William H. Stiles, Esquire

Verrill Dana, LLP One Portland Square Portland, ME 04101

### D. Michael Frink, Esquire

Curtis, Thaxter, Stevens, Broder & Micoleau, LLC One Canal Plaza P.O. Box 7320 Portland, ME 04112-7320

Respectfully submitted,

Joseph P. Ditré, Esq., Bar #3719 Consumers for Affordable Health Care 39 Green Street, P.O. Box 2490 Augusta, ME 04338-2490 jditre@mainecahc.org

Jack Comart, Esq.
Maine Equal Justice
126 Sewall Street
Augusta, Maine 04330
jcomart@mejp.org

#### Counsel to

Consumers for Affordable Health Care